Research Paper Critique

Depending on which paper you choose to critique, this homework is due at the beginning of class between Tuesday, Nov. 27 and Thursday, December 6.

An important skill for any graduate student is the ability to independently read and critique research papers. In this assignment, you are to choose one of the research papers assigned for class discussion between Tuesday, Nov. 27 on Thursday, December 6, thoroughly read it, and write a critique of the paper. This critique should be between 3 and 6 pages long, double-spaced. Your critique is due on the day the paper is to be discussed. In order to encourage you not to procrastinate, I am giving extra credit for critiques of papers that are due earlier:

- for papers due Tuesday, Nov. 27: +20
- for papers due Thursday, Nov. 29: +15
- for papers due Tuesday, Dec. 4: +5
- for papers due Thursday, Dec. 6: no bonus

Furthermore, no more than three students may critique the same paper. As a result, I need 5 or 6 people to sign up to write critiques of the papers assigned for next week. I will announce each of the assigned readings one week in advance, so that if you select that paper, you have time to read it and write your critique. I will expect students to inform me at that time if they will critique one of those papers.

The critique should summarize the paper and then provide your opinion on it. It should give the motivation for the work (i.e., why they wrote it), the methods they used (i.e., what they did and how they did it), and their conclusions (i.e., what they proved or found out). As for critiquing the paper, you should state whether you think the paper is valuable and why, and whether you think the methodology was sound (e.g., did they make unrealistic assumptions?). You should also point out anything you would have done differently, and also discuss what other research questions and problems the paper raises. Note, if you have trouble understanding the paper, then you should read some of the work mentioned in its references.