Research Paper Presentation and Critique

The written part of this assignment is due at the beginning of class on Thursday, December 4. You are also required to give an in-class presentation of the paper. The timing of this presentation will depend on the paper you choose, how it relates to other topics in the course, and a negotiation with me, but no presentation will be before Tuesday, Nov. 18. This assignment (the presentation and/or critique) will count for 10% of your overall grade.

An important skill for any graduate student is the ability to independently read and critique research papers. In this assignment, you are to choose a research paper related to the Semantic Web, thoroughly read it, and write a critique of the paper. This critique should be between 3 and 6 pages long, double-spaced.

The critique should summarize the paper and then provide your opinion on it. It should give the motivation for the work (i.e., why they wrote it), the contributions (i.e., how it advances the field), the methods they used (i.e., what they did and how they did it), and their conclusions (i.e., what they proved or found out). As for critiquing the paper, you should state whether you think the paper is valuable and why, and whether you think the methodology was sound (e.g., did they make unrealistic assumptions?). You should also point out anything you would have done differently, and also discuss what other research questions and problems the paper raises. Few published papers are perfect, so you should be able to find something to criticize.

You are also responsible for giving an in class presentation of your selected paper. This presentation should be 20 minutes long, with a 16 minute summary of the paper and a 4 minute class discussion led by you. Once everyone has selected a paper, I will consider the topics of your papers and the topics I plan to cover in the remainder of the course and propose a date for your presentation. There may be some flexibility with this date. If you have preferred dates or bad dates please let me know when you select your paper. The presentation will count for 30% of this assignment’s grade. I recommend that you complete your slides and/or notes at least 24 hours before your presentation so that you can discuss them with me.

Important Dates:
- Select you paper: Friday, November 7, 5pm
- Presentation schedule set: Tuesday, November 11
- Paper presentations: Tuesday, November 18 – Thursday, December 4
- Written critique due: Thursday, December 4, 10:45am

Guidance on Selecting Papers:
You may select any research paper from the "Semantic Web Reading List" (see http://www.cse.lehigh.edu/~heflin/courses/sw-readlist.html) that has not already been assigned as class reading. is acceptable. Note, by research paper I am excluding language specifications and tutorials. Please choose papers under the categories of “User Interfaces”, “Knowledge Acquisition” or “Ontology Merging and Alignment,” since these are important topics that we will not have covered with assigned readings. If you have a strong desire to review a paper not in this list, or a paper from a different area, please check with me. I may approve a limited number of such requests.
Note, the reading list only provides links to some of the papers, but most of them can be found on the Web. Below are some hints for how to locate a paper given its citation:

- Use CiteSeer, a special search engine for Computer Science articles. Available from http://citeseer.ist.psu.edu/
- Use Google Scholar: http://scholar.google.com/
- Many authors publish their articles on the Web. Use your favorite search engine to try to find the home page of one of the authors directly.
- If the paper is in a journal, Lehigh may have electronic access to it. Check http://www.lehigh.edu/library/ejournals/ejournals.html
- If all else fails, try Lehigh's library and see if you can find the article in print. The online catalog can be found at http://library.lehigh.edu/

Please try to find a paper that actually interests you. If you do not see one, good sources of other Semantic Web papers include the International Semantic Web Conference, the Journal of Web Semantics and the Semantic Web track of the World Wide Web Conference. As I mentioned above, if you would like to choose a paper from one of these (or other) sources, please check with me to make sure the paper is acceptable.

No two students may choose the same paper. Paper choices will be done on a “first-come, first-serve” basis. If there is a paper that you really want to critique, then notify me as early as possible.

Given the short amount of time before the first presentations, I will give extra credit on the assignment to students who give the earliest presentations. The extra credit will be as follows:

- presentation on Tue., Nov. 18: +15
- presentation on Thr., Nov. 20: +10
- presentation on Tue., Nov. 25 + 5